



City of Santa Barbara California

STAFF HEARING OFFICER STAFF REPORT

REPORT DATE: August 5, 2009
AGENDA DATE: August 12, 2009
PROJECT ADDRESS: 2050 Garden Street (MST2009-00289)
TO: Susan Reardon, Senior Planner, Staff Hearing Officer
FROM: Planning Division, (805) 564-5470
 Renee Brooke, AICP, Senior Planner *RLB*
 Roxanne Milazzo, Associate Planner *RM*

I. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The subject application involves two adjoining properties, totaling 15,828 square feet, which will be combined through a voluntary lot merger and have frontage on both Garden and E. Padre Streets. The property at 2050 Garden Street is currently developed with a single-family residence and detached two-car garage. The property at 314 E. Padre Street is currently developed with a single-family residence. The proposed project involves restoration of the residence at 2050 Garden Street and demolition of all other structures on the two lots, the construction of a detached two-car garage with attached accessory room, a detached accessory building, and various garden amenities. The discretionary applications required for this project are Modifications to permit alterations to the front porch and the addition of a parapet within both 30' front setbacks, window changes, garden amenities, and a portion of the detached accessory structure within the Padre Street 30' front setback, and alterations to an existing non-conforming garden wall located within the required 10' interior setback (SBMC §28.15.060 & 28.87.170).

Date Application Accepted: June 22, 2009 Date Action Required: September 22, 2009

II. RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Staff Hearing Officer approve the project, subject to a condition.

III. SITE INFORMATION AND PROJECT STATISTICS

A. SITE INFORMATION

Applicant: Harrison Design Associates	Property Owner: Melanie Ellison
Parcel Number: 025-331-001 & 02	Lot Area: 15,828 sf
General Plan: 3 Units Per Acre	Zoning: E-1
Existing Use: 2 One-Family Residences	Topography: Flat

Adjacent Land Uses: "

North – One-Family Residence
South – Garden Street

East - One-Family Residence
West – E. Padre Street

B. PROJECT STATISTICS

	Existing	Proposed
Living Area (Total)	4,734 sf	3,522
Garage	482 sf	500 sf
Accessory Space	N/A	368 sf

C. PROPOSED LOT AREA COVERAGE

Building: 3,527 sf 22% Hardscape: 4,165 sf 27% Landscape: 8,136 sf 51%

D. FLOOR-AREA RATIO (FAR) – GUIDELINE ONLY

Max. Allowed FAR: 0.28 Proposed FAR: 0.28 = 100.1% of Max. Allowed FAR

IV. DISCUSSION

The proposed project is a remodel and restoration of a Mission Revival style home that was one of five built for Mary Ann Crocker in 1889. Identified as the Crointher Residence, it represents one of the first group designs known as Crocker Row, which is worthy of City Landmark status. According to the City's Urban Historian, the new property owner's proposal is as close to a true restoration as possible. This application includes a request to merge this property with the adjacent lot located at 314 E. Padre. Demolition of the residence that currently exists on the E. Padre site is part of this application.

Several of the proposed changes to the 2050 Garden Street residence will require Modification approval due to their location within required setbacks. Specifically, the front porch and parapet are being restored back to the original style. Because the residence is non-conforming to both 30' front setbacks, Modifications are necessary to complete the alteration. Also proposed is the replacement of the living room windows on the East facing wall with a pair of doors, and a new window for the 2nd story dormer, which are both located on portions of the residence that are non-conforming to the secondary front setback facing E. Padre Street.

The existing garage is being demolished and replaced with a motor court that has the garage on one side and an accessory building containing storage, a mechanical room and ½ bath on the other. A breezeway attached to that accessory building projects approximately 6' into the secondary front setback, requiring a Modification. Landscape improvements including two garden benches, a fountain, and bird bath also require Modification approval for their location within the secondary front setback. Lastly, the gate opening in an existing overheight garden wall located within the interior 10' setback is being relocated within the wall area.

It is Staff's position that the requested Modifications, with the exception of the encroaching accessory structure, are required to complete the restoration and do so without impacts or intensification of use within the setbacks or to the neighborhood.

V. FINDINGS & CONDITIONS

The Staff Hearing Officer finds that the Modifications are consistent with the purposes and intent of the Zoning Ordinance and are necessary to secure an appropriate improvement on the lot. The proposed Modifications are necessary to complete the restoration of a piece of Santa Barbara History. Said approval is subject to a condition that the lot merger be completed prior to the issuance of the building permit.

The Staff Hearing Officer finds that the Modification to allow the detached accessory building to encroach into the front setback is not consistent with the purposes and intent of the Ordinance and is not necessary to secure an appropriate improvement on the lot. The project site is large enough to accommodate adequate accessory space in a location that conforms to the required setbacks.

Exhibits:

- A. Site Plan (under separate cover)
- B. Applicant's letter dated July 13, 2009
- C. Historic Landmark Commission Minutes

Contact/Case Planner: Roxanne Milazzo, Associate Planner
(rmilazzo@SantaBarbaraCA.gov)
630 Garden Street, Santa Barbara, CA 93101
Phone: (805) 564-5470

HARRISON DESIGN ASSOCIATES

Monday, July 13, 2009

Staff Hearing Officer
City of Santa Barbara
P.O.Box 1990
Santa Barbara, CA 93102-1920

**Re: Modification for 314 East Padre Street (APN 025-331-002) and
2050 Garden Street (APN 025-331-001) in the E-1 Zone District**

Dear Staff Hearing Officer:

There is an existing two-story house (3,760 sq. ft.) and a detached two-car garage on the property located at 2050 Garden Street. The house currently encroaches into the primary front yard setback at Garden Street and the secondary front yard setback at Padre Street. The existing garage encroaches into two interior yard setbacks at the East and South property lines.

On the property located at 314 East Padre Street, there exists a two-story house (1,212 sq. ft.). The house currently encroaches into the front yard setback at Padre Street and the interior setback at the East property line. No covered parking is currently provided for the property located at 314 East Padre Street.

The proposed project consists of the following items:

1. Voluntary Lot Line Merger of the parcels at 314 East Padre Street and 2050 Garden Street.
2. Demolish the existing, non-historic house at 314 East Padre Street.
3. Demolish the existing garage at 2050 Garden Street.
4. Construct a new detached garage, motor court and driveway, utility building and a pergola.
5. Re-landscape the grounds.

921 St. Vincent Avenue, Santa Barbara, California 93101

Phone: (805) 899-3434 • Fax: (805) 899-3439

www.harrisondesignassociates.com

EXHIBIT B

The following alterations, modifications and additions, which require a Modification for encroachment in the front yard, secondary front yard and side yards, are proposed to the parcels at 2050 Garden Street and 314 East Padre Street:

1. Restore the house's front porch to its original configuration and footprint. The porch would encroach into the primary and secondary yard set backs.

We propose to restore the porch to its historical proportions as documented by a circa-1895 photograph. Post/Hazeltine Associates recommends approval of this modification, which meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefit of restoring this feature is that it would enhance the integrity of Crocker Row house #5 and the adjoining houses on Crocker Row.

2. Replace an existing window on the house's east elevation with a pair of glazed doors. The existing window is located in the secondary front yard setback.

The existing door does not date to the period of significance, as it is not depicted on a photograph taken in circa 1895-1905. The removal of this feature will not significantly impact the ability of the house to convey its historic significance or architectural style. This alteration was approved by the Historic Landmarks Commission when the proposed rehabilitation/restoration scheme for 2050 Garden Street was reviewed in February of 2009. Post/Hazeltine Associates recommends approval of this modification, which meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits to having the proposed doors are: it will allow more natural light to enter the living room; it will provide a direct access from the living room to the formal gardens; it creates a relationship between the main residence and accessory structures.

3. Add a new window and dormer to the house's east elevation. The existing window is located in the secondary front yard setback.

The overall proportions of the dormer are sympathetic with the house's existing fenestration, but subtly differentiated from it by the use of a different glazing pattern. Its alteration will not unduly affect the ability of the house to convey its original architectural style or historic significance. Post/Hazeltine Associates recommends approval of this modification. This alteration was approved by the Historic Landmarks Commission when the proposed rehabilitation/restoration scheme for 2050 Garden Street was reviewed in February of 2009. The benefits of having a new window in the dormer are: the fenestration will provide light and cross ventilation to the master bathroom; the new window will create an appropriate treatment to the existing dormer.

4. Relocate the passage door in the garden wall located at the southeast corner of the house. The passage door will be located within the side yard setback.

A plastered garden wall located at the southeast corner of the house would be re-created. We propose to relocate the arched opening to the center of the wall, within the side yard setback. As noted in the 2009 HSR for 2050 Garden Street, the plastered garden walls postdate the period of significance. Post/Hazeltine Associates recommends approval of this modification. The benefit of relocating the door is that it provides adequate service circulation around the property.

5. The landscaping will include two stone benches located within the secondary front yard setback.

The proposed landscaping scheme, which includes two stone benches aligned with the secondary pathways and set along the north side of the rear garden, are modest in scale and design and reversible. With its restrained design, melding of formal and informal elements drawing their inspiration from the garden schemes of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, and use of native sandstone, the proposed design scheme form an appropriate setting for Crocker Row house #5. Post/Hazeltine Associates recommends approval of this modification, which meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards 9 and 10. The benefits of having the two stone benches are that stone benches were used historically; they add a dimensional element to the garden; benches create a sense of destination and provide a place for reflection on the garden.

6. A fountain and birdbath would be located in the secondary front yard setback.

The proposed landscaping scheme includes a fountain and birdbath set on axis with the main walkway linking the house with the motor court.

The fountain and birdbath came as a recommendation by the Historic Landmarks Commission when the proposed rehabilitation/restoration scheme for 2050 Garden Street was reviewed in February of 2009. Post/Hazeltine Associates recommends approval of this modification, which meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standard 9 and 10. The benefits of the water features are that fountains and birdbaths were historically used; water elements add a unique and desirable ambiance to gardens; the water features have been designed on axis linking the residence with the motor court and accessory structures.

7. Construct a utility building, whose north elevation would be located 5'-11 1/2" in the secondary front yard setback.

The proposed utility building is set on axis with the main walkway linking the house with the motor court through a covered breezeway. The modest scale, bulk

and massing of the proposed utility building does not visually compete with the main house. The design of the proposed utility building draws its inspiration from the house's Mission Revival Style without mimicking it. The benefits of having the utility building's covered breeze in its proposed location are: it forms a contextual addition that enhances the property; it is an appropriate historical use of transitional elements to connect differentiated uses within on project site.

8. Construct new privacy walls, pilasters and gates greater than 3'-6" in height within the first 20' from the property line at Padre Street.

The benefits of the new privacy walls, pilasters and gates at the proposed driveway are that they provide visual enhancement from the street and security for the motor court while providing continued visual clearance along the public way.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Adele Goggia', written in a cursive, flowing style.

Adele Goggia
Harrison Design Associates

2050 GARDEN STREET – HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MINUTES

July 8, 2009

(Comments only: Project requires Environmental Assessment, Zoning Modifications, and a voluntary lot merger.)

Present: Barbara Lowenthal, Agent; Kris Kimpel, Landscape Architect; Bernard Austin, Harrison Design Associates; Dan Fromanek, General Contractor; and Pam Post, Historical Consultant

Public comment opened at 2:46 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with positive comments: 1) The modifications for the front porch, as well as the landscape features including benches, birth bath and fountain area, are supportable. 2) The Commission finds the proposal to be a commendable project. 3) The expression of the garage as a similar style and feel in terms of grandeur and aesthetics to the house is appropriate to the estate feel of the property, now that the parcels are being merged. It provides coherence and unity to the site. 4) The reuse of the olive trees is appreciated. 5) Consider vine pockets for the pergola and provide a softening of the southeast portion of the pergola in the service corridor. 6) Evergreen pears would be appropriate for framing the garage. 7) Caution should be taken regarding the sandstone pattern that is to be used in the fireplace area. 8) In returning the structure to its historic feel, take caution with respect to construction and expression of new materials and techniques. 9) Provide more information as to topographic changes, fill, and retaining walls.

Action: Boucher/Adams, 7/0/0. (Pujo/Sharpe absent.) Motion carried.